An NFL Rule Comes to Level the Legal Playing Field

Mark A. Flores – November 14, 2017

Head coach Mike Tomlin has led the Pittsburgh Steelers to a Super Bowl championship, two AFC conference championships, and five AFC North Division championships. He has also won NFL Coach of the Year during his distinguished tenure as the head coach of one of the NFL’s most legendary franchises. He is also African American and considered an example of a success story arising out of the now well-known “Rooney Rule” championed by the former chairman of the Pittsburgh Steelers and one-time head of the NFL’s diversity committee, Dan Rooney. The Rooney Rule requires NFL franchises to interview at least one racially diverse candidate for all head coaching jobs, general manager jobs and other equivalent front-office positions.

Almost twenty years after the NFL first instituted a variation of the Rooney Rule, the law firm of Buchanan Ingersoll & Rooney—yes that same Rooney family—has agreed to take part in a similar pilot program called the Mansfield Rule, which is named after the first woman admitted to practice law in the United States—Arabella Mansfield—and is designed to promote more women and monitories into leadership positions within their firms or companies.

Art Rooney II, named partner of Buchanan Ingersoll & Rooney and President of the Pittsburgh Steelers, has reportedly stated, “My father would be proud to know that we are working together as a community to transition the Rooney Rule into the legal profession.” His firm and 43 other law firms have adopted the Mansfield Rule as part of a pilot program aimed at increasing the promotion of diverse lawyers across all areas of US law firms. The program, hosted by Diversity Lab in collaboration with Bloomberg Law and Stanford Law School, measures whether law firms affirmatively consider
women lawyers and lawyers of color for promotions, senior-level hiring, and significant leadership roles in the firm.

Under the Mansfield Rule, participating firms must consider 30 percent women and racially diverse attorneys for 70 percent or more of the firms’ openings in their various leadership committees and roles during a yearlong review period. Diversity Lab will conduct a review of the participating firms’ progress over the course of the year, determine whether the firms have met these goals, and qualify as “Mansfield-certified.”

“We are trying something new because some of the previous efforts, though well-intentioned, have not had as much impact as we would like,” said Lisa Kirby, director of research and knowledge sharing at Diversity Lab. She believes this effort will gain traction. As Kirby stated, “This approach has been tested in the NFL, as the Rooney Rule, and it has seen a lot of success in the NFL.”

Firms that become Mansfield-certified will receive a substantial award, namely an outstanding networking opportunity in late 2017. These firms will have the chance to send their recently promoted diverse partners to a two-day client forum to meet with more than 55 legal departments that have agreed to participate in the program. These potential clients range from Toyota to Google to Walmart and other large corporations. Tony West, then-executive vice president, general counsel, and corporate secretary of PepsiCo Inc., reportedly stated “We support the Mansfield Rule Client Forum because it reinforces our efforts to work with our outside counsel to advance diversity in the profession.”

Kirby confirmed that some firms are still working to establish the Mansfield Rule within their various management frameworks. “Firms have such individualized operations and they all function slightly differently,” explained Kirby. “At some firms, one challenge has been to coordinate effectively on lateral and partner hiring, because people at various offices and practice groups are used to having autonomy in their hiring.”

She explained that at those same firms, however, many of the lawyers—not just management—have expressed enthusiasm for the Mansfield Rule and its desired outcome of increasing diversity. She also said that many of the participating firms have noticed a push from their clients on this effort and an expectation to make diversity a priority.

“Some firms have signed on partly because of client encouragement,” said Kirby. “In-house legal department seem pretty enthusiastic.”

Patricia O’Prey, executive counsel with General Electric, certainly shares that enthusiasm. She believes the legal community has many qualified diverse attorneys to fill the roles targeted by the
Mansfield Rule and that the Mansfield Rule could change the dynamic within law firms with respect to promoting diverse attorneys to leadership.

“There are qualified and talented diverse lawyers out there in every specialty and every area of the practice,” said O’Prey. “Lawyers have a tendency to just call the friend they know in the field and I think the benefit of the Mansfield Rule is that this will not be enough anymore.”

O’Prey described the Mansfield Rule as a discipline that requires everyone from in-house counsel to law firms to consider people outside their normal circle of friends and attorneys upon whom they typically rely. O’Prey also recognized that the success of efforts like this will, in the long run, necessarily depend not only on in-house counsel recognizing law firms that institute practices like the Mansfield Rule but also on in-house counsel instituting the Mansfield Rule in their corporations’ hiring of outside counsel.

Diversity Lab has already checked in with firms at the three-month mark and plans to check-in with the forty-four firms participating at the six-month mark and to conduct a formal certification process at the one-year mark. Diversity Lab stated that it could not yet gauge the success of the program as law firms have only begun implementing the Mansfield Rule during this last summer. This has not tempered the enthusiasm of Diversity Lab.

“I think there is a lot of momentum and excitement in this program,” said Kirby. “Firms have told us that they are already making changes to their policies to implement the rules.”

The clients who will hire these law firms also expect the legal services they receive will benefit as a result of these efforts.

“It’s been proven that having a diverse group gets you better results and we all want quality representation,” explained O’Prey. “We want the best representation and you get that through diversity.”

Mark A. Flores is an associate with Haynes and Boone, LLP, in Fort Worth, Texas.
Diversity Initiative Names 'Certified' Firms for Women, Minority Leadership

Over 40 law firms can now call themselves "Mansfield Certified."

By Meghan Tribe | August 20, 2018

Launched last summer

(https://www.law.com/americanlawyer/almID/1202788981402/) as a corrective to an industry dominated by white men, the Mansfield Rule sought to tackle the gender and diversity gap in Big Law leadership in part by using a powerful promise: bragging rights.

Caren Ulrich Stacy. Photo: Diego M. Radzinschi/ALM
Now, 41 of the nearly 50 firms that implemented the rule in its inaugural pilot year have earned those rights, receiving the coveted designation, “Mansfield Certified.”

“Law firms are not typically early adopters on risky endeavors, especially ones where the results will be made public,” said Caren Ulrich Stacy, CEO of the Diversity Lab, which worked with the firms to implement the Mansfield Rule.

“But these 41 firms showed their true desire to boost diversity in leadership by trying something new and tough to implement,” she said.

Adopted from the National Football League’s Rooney Rule, which requires teams to interview at least one minority candidate for general manager or head coaching positions, the Mansfield Rule was developed following the 2016 Women in Law Hackathon (https://www.law.com/therecorder/almID/1202761112044/).

The rule requires that at least 30 percent of participating law firms’ candidate pools for leadership or governance roles—as well as equity partner promotions and senior lateral positions—be comprised of women or minorities.

In its inaugural year, the Diversity Lab collected data and information from law firms at the six-month and one-year mark. It also collected data at the conclusion of the first year of implementation on the firm’s current leadership roles, promotions and hiring outcomes to determine certification, Stacy said.

“This is a long-term play, [and] these firms are taking intentional and measured actions to diversify their leadership ranks,” she said.

Diversity Initiative Names 'Certified' Firms for Women, Minority Leadership | The American Lawyer

Bryan Cave; Buchanan Ingersoll & Rooney; Clifford Chance; Cooley; Covington & Burling; Day Pitney; Dentons; DLA Piper; Dorsey & Whitney; Faegre Baker Daniels; Fasken; Fenwick & West; Fish & Richardson; Goodwin Procter; Holland & Hart; Holland & Knight; Jenner & Block; Katten Muchin Rosenman; Latham & Watkins; Littler Mendelson; McDermott Will & Emery; Miller Canfield Paddock and Stone; Morgan, Lewis & Bockius; Morris, Manning & Martin; Morrison & Foerster; Munger, Tolles & Olson; Nixon Peabody.
In addition to the incremental increases in diverse candidates considered for some of Big Law’s top positions, Diversity Lab also found a significant surge in firms that are now tracking and measuring their candidate pipelines.

Prior to implementing the Mansfield Rule, only 30 percent of the 41 Mansfield Certified firms tracked diversity statistics among their pool of candidates for leadership positions, and an even smaller percentage tracked their lateral hirings for senior associate and partner positions. Now 100 percent of the 41 firms are tracking this information, the data found.

“The Mansfield Rule has really brought a rigor and discipline to the whole process,” said David Koschik, partner and member of White & Case’s executive committee.

“It’s also caused us to look at situations where we might either not have a female partner or diverse partner in our minds ready for a leadership opportunity [and] it’s caused us to look at why that is,” he said.
Koschik also noted that there is an external component to being Mansfield Certified that holds firms publicly accountable to clients and potential clients around the advancement of women and minorities.

Stacy noted that 70 legal departments have asked their current and potential outside counsel if they are certified or are in the process of becoming certified.

Earlier this summer, the Diversity Lab announced Mansfield 2.0 (https://www.law.com/americanlawyer/2018/06/22/mansfield-rule-2-0-aims-to-boost-law-firms-diversity-efforts/), which will broaden the obligation of law firms and expand the rule to include LGBTQ+ attorneys for the 65 law firms that have already signed on.

And while there were a handful of firms that didn’t finish the process or meet the requirements to become Mansfield Certified in its inaugural year, Stacy said Diversity Lab will keep working with them.

“Even if firms don’t qualify now, participation is encouraged and important because the act of measuring causes improvement,” she said.

It’s the firms that haven’t made the commitment that have the biggest challenge, Stacy said.

“They have a problem. They know they have a problem. And they still don’t do anything about it,” she said.
Law firms test 'Mansfield rule' to promote more women and minorities into leadership roles

BY DEBRA CASSENS WEISS

POSTED JUNE 12, 2017, 8:00 AM CDT

Thirty large law firms have pledged to test a new “Mansfield rule” that requires 30 percent of its leadership candidates to be minorities and women.

The rule is named after Arabella Mansfield, the first woman admitted to practice law in the United States, report the Am Law Daily and the Wall Street Journal Law Blog.

The rule requires women and minorities to comprise at least 30 percent of the candidates for leadership and governance roles, equity partner promotions, and lateral positions, according to a press release (PDF).

Caren Ulrich Stacy, CEO of the Diversity Lab, is partnering with the law firms in the pilot project. The firms will “help us form the idea, put it into fruition, see what works, see what doesn’t work,” she told the Am Law Daily.

The rule is modeled after the NFL's Rooney rule requiring that at least one minority be among those interviewed for positions as head coach or general manager.
The rule has evolved since it was first proposed by Munger, Tolles & Olson partner Mark Helm at the Women in Law Hackathon law summer, according to the Am Law Daily. The initial idea was for firms to agree to interview at least one woman for each law firm leadership role. Now there is a 30 percent requirement, and minorities are included.

Law firms that successfully test the rule will be “Mansfield certified” and be able to send their recently promoted diverse lawyers to meet with general counsel from 45 legal departments at a client forum.

The press release lists 26 firms that are among the 30 firms testing the rule. They are: Akerman; Arnold & Porter Kaye Scholer; Blank Rome; Buchanan Ingersoll & Rooney; Cooley; Dentons; DLA Piper; Faegre Baker Daniels; Fasken Martineau; Fenwick & West; Fish & Richardson; Holland & Hart; Holland & Knight; Jenner & Block; Miller Canfield; Morgan Lewis; Morrison & Foerster; Munger, Tolles & Olson; O'Melveny & Myers; Orrick; Paul Hastings; Reed Smith; Seyfarth Shaw; White & Case; WilmerHale; and Winston & Strawn.
Goals & Progress Update

The diversity imbalance in law firms took decades to solidify as barriers to advancement such as unequal access to opportunities and unconscious biases were baked into talent practices and the overall work environment. Even the most thoughtful and effective efforts to dissolve biases and remove obstacles will take time. That said, there are indicators and small wins that provide insight (and optimism) that particular activities and initiatives will eventually move the needle in a positive direction.

Based on the 44 participating law firms' progress thus far, the Mansfield Rule is likely one of those initiatives.

The overall long-term goal of the Mansfield Rule is to boost the representation of diverse lawyers at the leadership levels of a law firm. But as a starting point, the Rule’s “consideration nudges” are designed to increase a firm management’s awareness of and actions to diversify the pipeline of candidates for governance roles, lateral hiring openings, and equity partner promotions.

As anticipated, based on research and lessons learned from the Rooney Rule, six months into the pilot program we have observed short-term and early “wins” (detailed on the next page) that suggest change is happening.

While six months is certainly not enough time to uproot old processes and bring new outcomes to fruition, the mid-year data collection and check-ins with the 44 participating firms highlighted several structural and cultural changes that have already taken root. And, as with any pilot, there are also challenges and bumps in the road that will require modifications and improvements as we iterate the Mansfield Rule over time.

A brief overview of the progress, including small wins, challenges, and suggested modifications follows.
Overall Goal of Mansfield Rule -- Version 1.0

The goal of the Mansfield Rule is to increase the representation of diverse lawyers in leadership by broadening the pool of women lawyers and attorneys of color who are considered for significant governance roles, lateral openings, and promotions.

Shorter Term Goals, Measured at Six-Month Mark

Aggregated data across 44 participating firms

1. Track and Document the Pipeline of Candidates (You can’t measure how far you’ve journeyed unless you know where you started.)

- 20% Participating firms formally tracking the diversity of candidates for senior level hiring prior to the Mansfield Rule.
- 30% Participating firms formally tracking the diversity of candidates for leadership role appointments/elections prior to the Mansfield Rule.
- 60% Participating firms formally tracking the diversity of equity partner promotions prior to the Mansfield Rule.

2. Increase Management’s Awareness of the Candidate Population and Diversify the Pipeline at the Leadership Level

- 95% Participating firms that have experienced an increase in formal discussions among firm leaders regarding broadening the pool of diverse candidates for appointments to leadership positions and lateral hiring.
- 83% Participating firms that have reported an increase in formal discussions regarding broadening the pool for partnership promotions.
- Many participating firms added these discussions as a regular Management Committee agenda item.

3. Boost Transparency of Governance Processes, Procedures, and Qualifications

- 55% Participating firms that have have adopted Leadership Job Descriptions. (27.5% already had them; the other half are not adopting them yet.)
Longer-Term Goals, Measured at One Year Mark and Beyond

Increase the number of women and minorities in leadership ranks, TBA after first year.

Representative Feedback From Participating Firms

- The underlying intent of the Rule actually works in that it forces people ... onto the radar screen who would never have [been considered before] or who would have been [only] perfunctorily considered.

- The Mansfield Rule has been one of the best ways to demonstrate the need for conscious efforts to build diversity. Adopting the rule has helped us identify new candidates.

- The partners and firm leadership are more cognizant of hiring practices and the composition of the applicant pool.

- Having committed to follow the Mansfield Rule has enabled senior firm management to "punctuate" our commitment and to articulate it in a metrics-oriented way.

- [The biggest benefit has been] getting the firm and everyone to understand the need to accurately track [the pipeline] so we can hold ourselves accountable.

- It has been helpful to have an external lever to drive change; the Mansfield Rule has helped us drive forward at a different velocity.

- The “Knowledge Sharing” calls were really helpful and one of the best things about the program.

- Though we had been talking about improving diversity, the Mansfield Rule gave [us] more structure for some of those conversations, and [those conversations are] much more directed now.

- “Natural selection” hasn’t worked. The Mansfield Rule is providing the mechanism we need to improve diversity in leadership at the firm.

- We now have three women partners elected to the firmwide Management Committee (25%) -- more than [our firm] has ever had in the past -- including the first black women ever elected to the Committee.
Pilot Program Challenges

The most frequently mentioned challenges included:

• Lateral partner hiring: Achieving a unified, consistent process with timely communication that aligns with the Mansfield Rule framework. (Also, most lateral partner hiring is opportunistic.)

• Initial stages of implementation: Educating stakeholders and establishing new processes and systems.

• Attempting to add a degree of formality and structure to previous ad hoc ways of decision-making, e.g., “All of the leadership appointment considerations happen in my managing partner’s head!”

Feedback/Suggestions for Improvements and Changes

*Note: All of the suggestions have been included in the 2.0 version, which will launch July 2018.*

The most frequently shared suggestions for improvements and changes:

• Add LGBTQ+ to the certification categories.

• Provide more detailed information before the certification period begins regarding definitions and expectations.

• Provide more resources, such as tracking/documentation templates and additional communications templates, to help firms with rollout and ongoing operations.

• Improve surveys to not ask binary questions and to enable responders to save draft answers in the system.

Media and Press Mentions

In its inaugural year, the Mansfield Rule has been featured in numerous publications, including *Fortune*, the *American Lawyer*, the *ABA Journal*, and *Bloomberg Big Law Business*. 

Copyright © 2018 Diversity Lab LLC
Career/Talent/Diversity

Pilot of ‘Mansfield Rule’ Shows Early Diversity Progress at Firms

By Stephanie Russell-Kraft - Bloomberg Law
July 3, 2018

• New policy on diversity hiring is taking hold in legal market
• Expansion, 2.0-version, coming in matter of weeks

It’s been just six months since the adoption of a policy to consider more women and minority job candidates, and some law firms are already showing progress.
The Mansfield Rule, named after the first woman admitted to the bar in the U.S., requires firms to consider at least 30 percent women and minority lawyers for significant leadership roles, lateral openings, and equity partner promotions. It was adopted by 44 law firms last year and has been supported by more than 70 legal departments, including American Express, BASF, Google, Salesforce, 3M, and Target.

Before implementing the rule, almost 75 percent of participating firms didn’t have written job descriptions for leadership roles. Six months after adopting the rule, more than half of those firms had adopted written job descriptions, according to a new progress report published by Diversity Lab, the organization that designed the rule.

Job descriptions can provide transparency in the hiring process, thereby helping attorneys from marginalized groups.

“While six months — and even one year — is certainly not enough time to completely uproot old processes and change law firm cultures, these early indicators show that the Mansfield Rule’s discipline and accountability measures are already disrupting dialogues and practices within firms,” Caren Ulrich Stacy, CEO of Diversity Lab, said in a statement.

At the six-month check-in mark, 95 percent of participating firms reported an increase in formal discussions among firm leaders about broadening the pool of diverse candidates for lateral hiring and leadership promotions, according to Diversity Lab. Eighty-three percent of participating firms said they increased formal discussions about broadening the pool for partnership promotions.

“For those who have been doing so, we will be able to evaluate at year-end whether the firms have considered a more or less diverse candidate population and also whether or not they increased the representation of diverse individuals in leadership,” Ulrich Stacy told Bloomberg Law.

Stacy said she hopes to see improved diversity at participating firms “within 12-24 months.”

The report comes just weeks before the launch of the “Mansfield Rule 2.0,” which will include LGBTQ+ lawyers in addition to women and attorneys of color. The new rule will also require firms to make their election processes transparent and to measure which lawyers are being considered for client pitch meetings.
More than 30 law firms piloting the Mansfield Rule have already agreed to implement version 2.0, and 12 new firms have joined so far, according to Diversity Lab. The deadline for law firms to sign up for the 2.0 certification process is July 6.

To contact the reporter on this story: Stephanie Russell-Kraft in New York at srussellkraft@gmail.com

To contact the editor responsible for this story: Tom P. Taylor at ttaylor@bloomberglaw.com

Related Posts

Positive Results Mark End of Mansfield Rule Diversity Pilot
Wall Street Claims Success on Diversity — At Least With Interns

Greenberg Traurig Hires Show More Gender Diversity in Tech
Black, Hispanic Women Less Apt to Get U.S. Patents Than Whites

Special Report

Tech Change Drives New Legal Strategies. Download it now!

Clients consider us a long-term extension of their organizations. Why?

Because we earn their trust. It’s that simple.

Compliance
Contracts
Legal Analytics
Litigation & Investigations
Sponsored:

Deloitte.

External Resources

People-focused Leadership for CLOs

The evolution of forensic investigations

The legal department of the future

Resilient podcast series: Leaders on risk, crisis, and disruption

Attorney Alerts
Pilot of 'Mansfield Rule' Shows Early Diversity Progress at Firms – Big Law Business
How Lawyers Are Working to Change Their Industry's Diversity Problem

Forty-four major law firms and 55 corporate legal departments are teaming up to boost diversity in the legal profession by drawing on two inspirational figures: the late Dan Rooney, beloved owner of the Pittsburgh Steelers, and Arabella Mansfield, a 19th century women’s rights activist who became the first American woman admitted into the legal profession in 1869.

The 'Mansfield' rule, which was proposed by Dan Rooney and adopted by the NFL in 2003, required NFL teams to interview at least one minority candidate to fill head coaching vacancies. Eventually, it was expanded to include general manager positions and female candidates. In its first 10 years the Rooney Rule ushered in some real gains — but over time, its impact began to wane.

The new rule takes the old rule’s shortcomings into account. It was clear the Rooney Rule didn’t go far enough, says Caren Ulrich Stacy, the CEO of Diversity Lab, a research outfit that is experimenting with ways to improve diversity ratios in the legal profession. The Mansfield Rule, which is one of the diversity initiatives the Lab has helped shape, will measure whether firms are actively considering diverse candidates for at least 30% of open leadership and governance roles. In other words, if you have a slate of 10 potential hires, three...
need to be people of color or women. “Research shows that 30% in a candidate pool is a real tipping point,” says Stacy.

The new rule is clear about what a “governance role” actually is. Stacy ticks off a list: "Managing partner, chairperson, practice group leader, office head, compensation committee, policy committee, executive committee, equity partner — anything that has governance and leadership responsibilities associated with it has to hit the 30% consideration threshold,” she says.

Stacy has gone to the mattresses before over diversity. She spent 25 years as the head of talent for various law firms before heading out on her own. Diversity Lab is her second venture. "I spent all this time hiring lawyers and half of them worked out and half didn’t," she says, "I thought, ‘there must be a better way to think about this.’” She turned to data, research and behavioral science. “Other industries are doing a lot of research and development around talent, so why not apply that thinking to the law?”

It's a big issue. While the gender balance for first-year lawyers is roughly equal, "by the time they get to equity partnership, about nine or 10 years down the road, only about 16% are women.” Attorneys of color, particularly women, are up against a more substantial problem. “It’s not so much a leaky pipeline, though we lose plenty of attorneys of color along the way,” she says. "It's that there is no pipeline.”

One of the best aspects of the Mansfield Rule is that it was designed, in part, by actual lawyers. Last year, Diversity Lab held a Women In Law Hackathon in collaboration with Stanford Law School and Bloomberg Law, in search of new, scalable inclusion ideas. Some 54 senior-level partners from law firms across the U.S. worked in virtual teams of six, with two expert advisors and assistance from a Stanford Law student, for six months. The teams presented their ideas in a high-energy pitch event in front of big league judges, including Tony West, Pepsico's General Counsel and Alan Bryan, Walmart's senior associate general counsel. While the Mansfield Rule was the big winner, four other ideas presented that day are also being developed at the Diversity Lab.
Because so many firms participated in the hackathon, the Mansfield Rule had a built-in, receptive audience from the get-go. The inaugural participants now have 12 months to prove the idea’s merit. Any firm that can demonstrate they adhered to the guidelines throughout the year will become Mansfield Rule certified. This distinction comes with a real perk: the candidates hired or promoted through the process are eligible to attend a two-day client forum in 2018, attended by 55 corporate in-house legal honchos there to network, mentor and perhaps offer lucrative new business. Among those committed are representatives from 3M, Cargill, Facebook, Ford, Google, Medtronic, Salesforce, Target and Walmart.

“We believe that diversity delivers better results,” said Julie Gruber, executive vice president and global general counsel of Gap Inc. in a statement. “We’ve worked for years to help drive meaningful diversity at our preferred law firm providers, and supporting the Mansfield Rule Client Forum is an important next step in this work.”

This same corporate cohort is working with Diversity Lab to adapt the Mansfield Rule, which is law firm specific, to traditional corporate structures. And just in time. “Since we announced this, I’ve gotten calls from financial services firms, manufacturing, healthcare and tech firms asking about it,” says Stacy. The plan is to study the results from the first year and share everything they learn. “We’ll see where it moves the needle and where it falls short,” she says. “And then iterate from there.”